

ENFORCEMENT ACTION AGAINST
THE DAVID YILMAZ LIVING TRUST
WITH RESPECT TO OAK PARK
APARTMENTS (LIHTC FILE # 91056 /
CMTS # 965)

§
§
§
§
§

BEFORE THE
TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF
HOUSING AND
COMMUNITY AFFAIRS

AGREED FINAL ORDER

General Remarks and official action taken:

On this 26th day of May, 2016, the Governing Board (“Board”) of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs (“TDHCA”) considered the matter of whether enforcement action should be taken against **THE DAVID YILMAZ LIVING TRUST** (“Respondent”).

This Agreed Order is executed pursuant to the authority of the Administrative Procedure Act (“APA”), Tex. Gov’t Code §2001.056, which authorizes the informal disposition of contested cases. In a desire to conclude this matter without further delay and expense, the Board and Respondent agree to resolve this matter by this Agreed Final Order. The Respondent agrees to this Order for the purpose of resolving this proceeding only and without admitting or denying the findings of fact and conclusions of law set out in this Order.

Upon recommendation of the Enforcement Committee, the Board makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law and enters this Order:

WAIVER

Respondent acknowledges the existence of their right to request a hearing as provided by TEX. GOV’T CODE § 2306.044, and to seek judicial review, in the District Court of Travis County, Texas, of any order as provided by TEX. GOV’T CODE § 2306.047. Pursuant to this compromise and settlement, the Respondent waives those rights and acknowledges the jurisdiction of the Board over Respondent.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Jurisdiction:

1. During 1991, Dominion Equity Corporation (“Prior Owner”) was awarded an allocation of Low Income Housing Tax Credits by the Board, in an annual amount of \$711,850 to rehabilitate and operate Oak Park Apartments (“Property”) (HTC file No. 91056 / CMTS No. 965 / LDLD No. 139).
2. Prior Owner signed a land use restriction agreement (“LURA”) regarding the Property. The LURA was effective November 7, 1991, and filed of record at Volume 91227, Page

5621 of the Official Public Records of Real Property of Dallas County, Texas (“Records”). In accordance with Section 2 of the LURA, the LURA is a restrictive covenant/deed restriction encumbering the property and binding on all successors and assigns for the full term of the LURA.

3. Respondent took ownership of the Property on December 30, 2005 and, although an Agreement to Comply was not signed, Respondent is bound to the terms of the LURA in accordance with Section 2 thereof.
4. Respondent is a trust that is qualified to own, construct, acquire, rehabilitate, operate, manage, or maintain a housing development that is subject to the regulatory authority of TDHCA.

Compliance Violations¹:

5. An on-site monitoring review was conducted during February of 2015 to determine whether Respondent was in compliance with LURA requirements to lease units to low income households and maintain records demonstrating eligibility. The monitoring review found violations of the LURA and TDHCA rules. Notifications of noncompliance were sent and a May 21, 2015, corrective action deadline was set, however, the following violations were not corrected before the corrective action deadline and no corrective documentation was submitted in response to Enforcement Committee intervention:
 - a. Respondent failed to provide documentation that household incomes were within prescribed limits upon initial occupancy for unit 211, a violation of 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §10.611 (Determination, Documentation and Certification of Annual Income) and Section 4 of the LURA, which require screening of tenants to ensure qualification for the program;
 - b. Respondent failed to provide a Notice of Amenities and Services to unit 211, a violation of 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §10.613 (Lease Requirements), which required owners to provide to each household, at the time of execution of an initial lease and whenever there was a subsequent change in amenities and services, a notice describing those amenities and services. This form has since been combined with the Fair Housing Disclosure Notice into a replacement document called a “Tenant Rights and Resources Guide.”
6. The following violations remain outstanding at the time of this order:
 - a. Household income violation described in FOF #5a;
 - b. Notice of Amenities and Services violation described in FOF #5b;

¹ Within this Agreed Final Order, all references to violations of TDHCA Compliance Monitoring rules at 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE, CHAPTERS 10 AND 60 refer to the versions of the code in effect at the time of the compliance monitoring reviews and/or inspections that resulted in recording each violation. All past violations remain violations under the current code and all interim amendments.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Department has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code §§2306.041-.0503, and 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §2.
2. Respondent is a "housing sponsor" as that term is defined in Tex. Gov't Code §2306.004(14).
3. Pursuant to IRC §42(m)(1)(B)(iii), housing credit agencies are required to monitor for noncompliance with all provisions of the IRC and to notify the Internal Revenue Service of such noncompliance.
4. Respondent violated 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §10.611 and Section 4 of the LURA in 2015, by failing to provide documentation that household incomes were within prescribed limits upon initial occupancy for the unit 211;
5. Respondent violated 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §10.613 in 2015, by failing to execute the Notice of Amenities and Services for unit 211;
6. Because Respondent is a housing sponsor with respect to the Property, and has violated TDHCA rules and agreements, the Board has personal and subject matter jurisdiction over Respondent pursuant to TEX. GOV'T CODE §2306.041 and §2306.267.
7. Because Respondent is a housing sponsor, TDHCA may order Respondent to perform or refrain from performing certain acts in order to comply with the law, TDHCA rules, or the terms of a contract or agreement to which Respondent and TDHCA are parties, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code §2306.267.
8. Because Respondent has violated rules promulgated pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Chapter 2306 and has violated agreements with the Agency to which Respondent is a party, the Agency may impose an administrative penalty pursuant to TEX. GOV'T CODE §2306.041.
9. An administrative penalty of \$500.00 is an appropriate penalty in accordance with 10 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §2.

Based upon the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, and an assessment of the factors set forth in Tex. Gov't Code §2306.042 to be considered in assessing such penalties as applied specifically to the facts and circumstances present in this case, the Board of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs orders the following:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Respondent is assessed an administrative penalty in the amount of \$500.00.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent shall pay and is hereby directed to pay the full \$500.00 administrative penalty by cashier's check payable to the "Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs" within 30 days of the date this order is executed.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Respondent shall fully correct the file monitoring violations as indicated in the attachments and submit full documentation of the corrections to TDHCA on or before thirty days from the date this order is executed.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that corrective documentation must be uploaded to the Compliance Monitoring and Tracking System (“CMTS”) by following the instructions at this link: <http://www.tdhca.state.tx.us/pmcdocs/CMTSUserGuide-AttachingDocs.pdf>. After the upload is complete, an email must be sent to Ysella Kaseman at ysella.kaseman@tdhca.state.tx.us to inform her that the documentation is ready for review. The penalty payment must be submitted to the following address:

If via overnight mail (FedEx, UPS):	If via USPS:
TDHCA Attn: Ysella Kaseman 221 E 11 th St Austin, Texas 78701	TDHCA Attn: Ysella Kaseman P.O. Box 13941 Austin, Texas 78711

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the terms of this Agreed Final Order shall be published on the TDHCA website.

[Remainder of page intentionally blank]

Approved by the Governing Board of TDHCA on May 26, 2016.

By: /s/ J Paul Oxer
Name: J. Paul Oxer
Title: Chair of the Board of TDHCA

By: /s/ James Beau Eccles
Name: James "Beau" Eccles
Title: Secretary of the Board of TDHCA

THE STATE OF TEXAS §
§
COUNTY OF TRAVIS §

Before me, the undersigned notary public, on this 26th day of May, 2016, personally appeared J. Paul Oxer, proved to me to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

(Seal)

/s/ Peggy M. Henderson
Notary Public, State of Texas

THE STATE OF TEXAS §
§
COUNTY OF TRAVIS §

Before me, the undersigned notary public, on this 26th day of May, 2016, personally appeared James "Beau" Eccles, proved to me to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

(Seal)

/s/ Peggy M Henderson
Notary Public, State of Texas

